11th CSPCWG/1st NCWG Meeting Rostock, Germany, 27-30 April 2015

Paper for Consideration by CSPCWG/NCWG

Light Vessels – Further Considerations

Submitted by: CSPCWG Chair

Executive Summary: A number of further issues relating to the reinstatement of a

symbol for light vessels have been raised as a consequence of the progression of related actions from CSPCWG9 and CSPCWG10. Before taking these issues further, it is considered that these should be discussed by the

CSPCWG/NCWG in regard to the decisions previously taken

by the Working Group.

Related Documents: 1. IHO CL 44-1993 (copy included for CSPCWG11/NCWG1

as CSPCWG11-08.14B);

CSPCWG9-08.02A – Light Vessels;
 CSPCWG10-08.04A_Light_Vessels_PJ;
 CSPCWG9 and CSPCWG10 Minutes;

5. Note on the CSPCWG proposal to reinstate a symbol for

light vessel - G. Bessero - IHB.

Related Projects: S-4 Maintenance;

INT1 Maintenance.

Introduction / Background

Following the progression of actions relating to the reinstatement of a light vessel symbol for charts, the IHB raised issues related to previous discussions between IALA and the former IHO Chart Standardization Committee regarding the light vessel symbol. These discussions resulted in the IHO approving a single symbol for depicting light vessels, major light floats and LANBY's on charts, which had not been fully considered by the CSPCWG in determining the more recent CSPCWG actions (copies of the relevant IHO CL's had not been made available). It is considered that the CSPCWG should be fully apprised of these previous discussions and the previous decisions and actions of the CSPCWG reevaluated for appropriateness and a way forward determined.

This paper combines all previous discussion regarding the depiction of light vessels on paper charts for further consideration of the CSPCWG/NCWG.

Analysis / Discussion

Papers CSPCWG9-08-02A and CSPCWG10-08.04A are included at Annexes A and B to this Paper for reference. IHO CL 44-1993 is included for reference during discussions at CSPCWG11/NCWG1 as paper CSPCWG11-08.14B, as the copy supplied by the IHB was in .pdf format only (unfortunately the first page of this CL is missing). A copy of the notes related to the CSPCWG proposal to reinstate a symbol for a light vessel from Gilles Bessero, Director IHB, is also included at Annex C to this paper for reference.

The following is a chronological summary of the discussions that have occurred regarding a symbol for light vessels since CSPCWG9.

The resultant summary of discussions and actions as included in the Minutes of CSPCWG9 and CSPCWG10 are as follows:

[CSPCWG9]

8.2. Light vessels (UK)

Docs: CSPCWG9-08.2A Light vessels

The meeting agreed that there should be a separate symbol for depicting light vessels (or lightships), distinct from the 'LANBY' and minor light float symbols. The old distinction between 'manned light vessels' and 'unmanned major light floats' is no longer relevant; the visual appearance of the vessel, very different

from a large buoy, is considered more significant. The symbol should be based on a slightly simplified version of the obsolescent P6 (3 masts with 'X' on centre mast, no 'shading' to stern and bow, flare from position circle). It was considered that most mariners would expect to find the symbol in section Q rather than P, so Q32 was suggested to be the place in INT1, with the sub-title changed to 'Light floats and Light vessels'.

It was not known whether any LANBYs still exist, so the Secretary was asked to seek clarification from IALA.

ACTION 18: Secretary to draft revision on light vessels to S-4 for WG review. New Work Plan item.

ACTION 19: INTsubWG to consider where and how to include a simplified version of the old light vessel symbol in INT1; also to review placement of other floating light structures.

ACTION 20: Secretary to ask IALA to advise whether 'LANBY's still exist.

[CSPCWG10]

8.4. Light vessels (UK)

Docs: CSPCWG10-08.4A Light vessels

The meeting decided that the proposed light vessel symbol, with the 'X' removed is sufficiently prominent because it will always have a light description and flare, and usually other things such as name and a radio aid. S-4 should indicate that the colour 'may' be added, but that if IALA characteristics are required (eg topmark), then the light float should be used.

It also decided that it should be shown in INT1 at Q32 (heading amended to 'Light vessels and minor light floats'). P6 should be retired (the superbuoy symbol is still available at Q26 if a LANBY needs to be charted).

ACTION 16: Secretary to revise light vessel symbol (remove 'X') and progress to MS approval.

ACTION 17: INT1 subWG to retire P6; add new Light Vessel at Q32 (and amend heading to 'Light vessels and minor light floats').

The following draft changes to S-4 and INT1 were subsequently drafted by the CSPCWG Secretary and discussed and approved by the CSPCWG Secretariat for inclusion in an IHO Circular Letter seeking member State approval:

Proposed changes in red.

B-474 MAJOR FLOATING LIGHTS

- **B-474.1 Major floating lights.** (For an explanation of the term 'major' see B-470.2.)* are generally classed as those with a nominal range in excess of 10 nautical miles. Special circumstances, eg an isolated location, may mean that a floating light of lower range is given this status. The structure on which the light is fixed will normally be a light vessel, (also known as a lightship or major light float) or a superbuoy but may be mounted on other buoy types with high focal planes. Note: A LANBY (Large Automatic Navigational Buoy) which is a type of superbuoy on which major lights have been mounted, may no longer exist, see B-460.4*.
- B-474.2 The symbol for a major floating light must be either,

for a light vessel:



The colour of the structure does not normally indicate on which side it should be passed and therefore should not normally be charted (this is consistent with the omission of colour from major shore light structures on paper charts) but may be included, if relevant. Details of the structure may be found in List of Lights and Fog Signals (LL).

Guidance on associated legends and symbols are found in the relevant sections of S-4; for particular guidance on light descriptions associated with major floating lights, see B-466.4.

* Note that these refer to the changes already agreed in response to CL58/2013.

Consequential amendments to S- and INT1:

- **B-466.1** a. **Light descriptions** on floating marks, including the order of the various elements, should be the same as those used for fixed marks (see B-471). Height and range are not generally charted for buoys, except but should be for light vessels and superbuoys (see B-474 B-466.4). The text should be sloping.
- **B-466.4** (first sentence of second paragraph)

The period is normally the final part of the light-description for buoys, except in the case of but not for light vessels and superbuoys (see B-460.4b and B-462.9) where height and/or range may be added, see B-474.

INT1 1. Add new light vessel symbol at Q32, and change sub-heading to *Light Vessels and Minor light floats*2. Retire P6.

The draft changes above are in accordance with the decisions of both the CSPCWG9 and CSPCWG10 meetings, and as such it was considered that no further input from the CSPCWG was required. However, subsequent to the request to the IHB to circulate the proposed changes for IHO Member State approval via IHO Circular Letter, concerns were raised by the IHB as to the merit of the proposed changes, considering previous discussions between IALA and the former Chart Standardization Committee (CSC). These discussions resulted in the IHO decision to rationalise light vessels, major light floats and LANBY's to a single symbol, included in INT1 at P6 (superbuoy structure symbol), which was proposed via IHO CL 44/1993 and IHO MS approval reported via IHO CL 15/1994. The concerns of the IHB were expressed via the "Note on the CSPCWG proposal to reinstate a symbol for light vessel", a copy of which is included at Annex C to this paper.

Subsequent discussions between the CSPCWG Secretary and Chair, the UKHO and Trinity House, taking into account all previous discussions and papers, have concluded that it is still desirable to reinstate a symbol for a light vessel. However, given the discussions and decisions taken in the 1990's, further advice should be requested from IALA. It is understood by the CSPCWG Secretariat that such a request is required to be initiated by the IHO (through the IHB) as a function of the IHO's Memorandum of Understanding with IALA.

To summarise the main discussion points:

- The IHO agreed in 1994, on request from IALA, to rationalise light vessels, major light floats and LANBY's, regardless of their shape, into a single paper chart symbol (INT1 – P6) in order to reduce paper chart maintenance where structures supporting major floating lights are regularly interchanged.
- Paper CSPCWG9-08.02A questioned whether the decision made in 1994 was the correct decision, citing the opinions of the senior editor of the UKHO's Sailing Directions. However, the rationale behind the 1994 decision was not included in this paper. There were no recommendations in the paper; however on discussion CSPCWG9 Actions 18-20 were agreed.
- Information supplied to the CSPCWG indicated that LANBY's were no longer in use.
- Paper CSPCWG10-08.04A resulted in further discussion regarding the symbol to be used for a light vessel, and location in INT1. The conclusion of the meeting suggested a minor amendment to the

symbol agreed at CSPCWG9 (removal of the "X" from the centre mast), resulting in CSPCWG10 Actions 16 and 17.

- Changes to S-4 and suggested changes to INT1 were subsequently drafted by the CSPCWG Secretary and approved by the CSPCWG Secretariat. These were included in a draft IHO CL forwarded to the IHB.
- Subsequent feedback from the IHB included the rationale behind the decisions taken in 1994 and suggested that the CSPCWG reconsider the issue, in terms of the background behind the decisions taken in 1994 and the impact on encoding in ENC and portrayal in ECDIS.
- Further discussion between CSPCWG Secretariat, UKHO and Trinity House reinforce the
 recommendation to reintroduce a symbol for light vessels, however it is considered that further
 discussion should be initiated with IALA. CSPCWG Chair considers that before this occurs further
 discussion should take place within the CSPCWG/NCWG.
- Here we all are!

Some other questions/discussion points related to the above summary include:

- Is the depiction of a single symbol for light vessels, major light floats and LANBY's providing the appropriate level of information (for daytime navigation) to the mariner (noting also that the indication is that LANBY are no longer in use)?
- From an ENC perspective, there is no issue with encoding, as there is a dedicated S-57 Object Class
 Light Vessel (LITVES) refer S-57 Appendix A, Chapter 1 Object Classes, page 1.99. Similarly,
 there is a distinctive ECDIS symbol for the portrayal of an encoded LITVES object in ECDIS, both for
 traditional and simplified ECDIS symbol display settings refer S-52 Presentation Library Part 1,
 Addendum, pp 176 and 177. However it should be noted that the traditional symbol includes the "X"
 on the mast.

Conclusions

Further discussion is required by the CSPCWG/NCWG, taking into account the rationale behind the decision of the IHO, in liaison with IALA, in 1994 to rationalise light vessels, major light floats and LANBY's to a single paper chart symbol.

Recommendations

The CSPCWG/NCWG to further discuss and re-evaluate previous decisions made at CSPCWG9 and CSPCWG10 regarding the depiction of light vessels on charts.

If the original decisions to reinstate a symbol for light vessels are agreed, the NCWG to develop a proposal for submission to IALA outlining an IHO argument as to the reasons for these decisions and the reasons for the proposal to overturn the decisions made in 1994.

Justification and Impacts

Reinstating a symbol for light vessels is considered to be an improvement in chart content for the mariner in regard to daytime navigation. However, the decision to do so must be based on consideration of all previous discussion on this topic.

The recommendations above are aimed at addressing Work Item D32.4 of the NCWG Work Program.

Action required of CSPCWG

The CSPCWG is invited to:

- a. Note this Paper;
- b. **Discuss** the recommendations;
- c. **Determine** appropriate actions.

Annexes:

- A: CSPCWG9-08.02A Light Vessels (UK).
- B: CSPCWG10-08.04A Light Vessels (UK).
- C: Note on the CSPCWG proposal to reinstate a symbol for light vessel (IHB).

CSPCWG9-08.2A

9th CSPWG MEETING Seoul, Republic of Korea, 13-16 November, 2012

Paper for Consideration by CSPCWG

Light vessels

Submitted by: UK

Executive Summary: Was the 1994 decision to use the same symbol for Light

Vessels as Lanbys correct?

Related Documents: S-4, INT1
Related Projects: None

Introduction / Background.

IHO Member States approved (by CL15/1994) the use of the P6/Q26 'LANBY' symbol for all major floating lights in response to CL 44/1993. All 'major floating lights' includes 'light vessels' by definition; see (B-474.1). The old Light Vessel symbol (boat shape with three masts and an X on the central mast) became obsolescent (P6 Column 4). It is understood that this symbology change was originally proposed by IALA. Unfortunately, these CLs are not available on the IHO website and the Secretary has not been able to recover any copies.

The following email was recently sent to the Secretary, by a retired navigator in UKHO who is currently a senior editor of UKHO's Admiralty Sailing Directions:

Andrew.

We seem to have a situation where there are inconsistencies between what is shown on the chart, how we describe a light vessel and what is actually on station. For example we have:

Channel LV Chart 2656 Symbol Q31 Listed under "Minor Light Floats" as "Minor light float not part of IALA system"

Chart 2454 Symbol Q26 "Superbuoy. Superbuoys are very

large buoys ..."

Chart 2669 Symbol Q31

SD description "Channel Light Float (red hull, light tower

amidships)"

Light ListA1520 "red hull light tower amidships"

Foxtrot 3 LV Chart 2449 Symbol Q26

Chart 323 Symbol Q26 Chart 1183 Symbol Q26

Greenwich LV Chart 2656 Symbol Q31

Chart 2451 Symbol Q26 Chart 2450 Symbol Q26

SD description "Greenwich Light Float (red hull, 'Greenwich' in

white, light tower amidships, 12 m in height."

Light ListA1520 "red hull 'Greenwich' in white light tower amidships,

12 m in height"

These three examples are all actually light vessels, that is they have a ship-shaped hull with a mast amidships, from which the lights are exhibited. From a mariner's point of view the Q26 symbol is misleading as he would expect to see a Lanby-like buoy, that is a circular hull about 5 m in diameter. The mismatch between the shape of what the mariner sees and the shape of what is shown on the chart introduces an element of doubt in the mariner's mind which we should be helping to avoid.

I fully accept that the small print of the IHO chart specifications [S-4] may allow a ship shape to be represented by a Lanby shape, but the mariner does not refer to IHO specifications when carrying out practical navigation.

I would make two points:

- 1. That the use of symbol Q30 or 31 would be a better symbol than Q26 for those aids listed by Trinity House as light vessels.
- 2. That we should re-introduce into 5011 [INT1] a proper symbol for light vessels and the symbol should look like a light vessel.

Analysis / Discussion.

While the symbol used does not matter at night, when it is only the light description which is important, could it be significant to the mariner if the structure he actually sees is nothing like the symbol on the chart?

Do LANBYs still exist? All have been withdrawn in waters around British Isles.

It is believed that the distinction of a light vessel being manned and a light float being unmanned is now time expired. (This distinction is still referenced in UKHO's Mariner's Handbook glossary and in FR INT1 Q31.) In reality, they may look identical.

See Annex for various definitions.

Conclusions.

None

Recommendations.

None

Justification and Impacts.

None at present

Action required of CSPCWG.

The CSPCWG is invited to:

Consider whether any change should be made, eg:

- reintroduce the obsolescent Light Vessel symbol (P6)
- widen the application of 'minor light float' symbols (Q30/31) to include light vessels
- Use Q31 with 'all-round light' circle on multicoloured charts.

Annex to CSPCWG9-08.2A

Definitions from IALA dictionary

Light vessel/Lightship. A vessel designed to carry a signal light of high luminous intensity, and moored or anchored at a designated geographical location to assist marine navigation.

Light float. An unmanned floating mark that is commonly boat-shaped and is fitted with a signal light. It may carry various additional aids to navigation.

Definitions from S-32

Light Vessel. See lightship.

Lightship. A distinctively marked vessel anchored or moored at a charted point, to serve as an <u>aid to navigation</u>. By night it displays a characteristic <u>light</u>, and is usually equipped with other devices, such as a <u>fog signal</u>, <u>submarine sound signal</u>, and <u>radiobeacon</u>, to assist <u>navigation</u>. Also called light vessel.

Light float. A boat-like structure used instead of a light buoy in waters where strong streams or currents are experienced, or when a greater elevation than that of a light buoy is necessary.

These are not defined in S-12. However, S-12 does contain the following table.

The typographic elements employed allow the following distinctions to be made:

CAPITALS	geographic entities
lowercase upright and bold	land based lights with nominal range of at
	least 15 nautical miles
lowercase upright and light	other land based lights, resilient and buoyant
	beacons
ITALIC CAPITALS	light vessels
lowercase italic	light floats and all other floating lights/buoys

Definitions from UKHO's 'Mariner's Handbook'

light vessel. A manned vessel, secured in a designated locality carrying a light of high luminous intensity and usually sounding a fog signal to assist navigation. Also known as lightship.

light float. An unmanned fully-automated vessel, comparable in size to a light vessel, or a boat-shaped unmanned float carrying a light and sometimes sounding a fog signal. The former is a major navigational light; the latter may sometimes be used instead of a light buoy where there are strong tidal streams or currents.

CSPCWG10-8.4A

10th CSPWG MEETING Wellington, New Zealand, 21-24 January, 2014

Paper for Consideration by CSPCWG Light Vessels

Submitted by: UK

Executive Summary: Although the 'new' light vessel symbol proposed following

CSPCWG9 was approved by responses to WG Letter 06/13,

some further questions arise.

Related Documents: CSPCWG9-08.2A; CSPCWG9 report; CSPCWG Letters 06 &

11/2013; INT1subWG report (CSPCWG10-11.1A)

Related Projects: Next editions of INT1

Introduction / Background.

- CSPCWG9 agreed that there should be a separate symbol for depicting light vessels (or lightships), distinct from the 'LANBY' (Large Automatic Navigational BuoY) and minor light float symbols. The old distinction between 'manned light vessels' and 'unmanned major light floats' is no longer relevant; the visual appearance of the vessel, very different from a large buoy, is considered more significant.
- 2. The symbol should be:
 - Based on a slightly simplified version of the obsolescent P6 (3 masts with 'X' or light star on centre mast, no 'shading' to stern and bow, flare from position circle).
 - Located in section Q, where most mariners would expect to find the symbol, rather than P
 - Placed at Q32 (INT1), with the sub-title changed to 'Light floats and Light vessels'.
- 3. Although the symbol was agreed (and its location in Section Q of INT1), questions have been raised since:
 - Some have expressed doubts that the symbol is sufficiently more prominent than the minor light float symbol;
 - One respondent to Letter 06/13 apparently thought that the 'X' on the centre mast was a topmark;
 - Another correspondent suggested that colour should be added, in case it was significant as an IALA mark (and the same could apply therefore to a topmark);
 - The INT1 subWG expressed the view that P6 would be a better location in INT1 (to complement the existing LANBY symbol) and also that the symbol should be reviewed.

Analysis / Discussion.

4. Symbol

- 4.1 The 'new' symbol that was agreed is:
 - A slightly revised obsolete symbol;
 - The same size as the minor light float symbol. The only visual differences are the superstructure (including a real topmark on the light float) and the filled-in body in the case of a green lateral float;
 - Not more prominent; indeed, it may be less;
 - The 'X' (or small star in FR's INT1) on the mast is a left-over from when it represented the light star (in common with obsolete versions of buoys and light floats) and the flare used to be attached to the 'X'. It now serves no function other than to help distinguish it from the light float symbol and, although slightly different, could be mistaken for an IALA special topmark;

- But without the 'X' the light vessel symbol would look very bare and certainly be less prominent.
- 4.2 While most floating lights are on buoys and represented by a flare attached to the position circle of the profile buoy (or minor light float) symbol, most other lights are shown as 'plan' light star symbols. Therefore, one option could be that a major floating light should be treated similarly, eg by a light star superimposed on a 'plan' symbol, similar to L17. This would:
 - Be distinctive from the minor light float symbol;
 - However, it may be less intuitive to the mariner;
 - Possibly it should also have an 'all-round light' coloured circle on multicoloured charts (although that is contrary to current specification B-470.4a.v 2nd bullet);
 - Such a symbol would not lend itself to addition of colour abbreviation or topmarks.
- 4.3 A simpler option would be to use a larger and bolder version of Q30. (Note: Light vessels are usually at sea, whereas light floats usually act as light buoys in rivers where currents may be a problem for normal buoys.):
 - This could mean using essentially the same symbol: a large version meaning light vessel and a small version (the current Q30) meaning light float;
 - It could also have an 'all-round light' coloured circle on multicoloured charts (although that is contrary to current specification B-470.4a.v 2nd bullet);
 - A higher superstructure could be developed (perhaps with a 'lantern' or lattice Q111 shape in place of the 'X' to look more like:



- 4.4 It would, of course, be possible to add such a picture to the chart (in accordance with B-390.1), but could not be mandated, so a distinctive symbol is necessary.
- 4.5 A further possibility would be to use a standard light star at the top of the tower, but this could cause confusion about the position of the vessel (which is always the base of a profile symbol).

5. IALA - MBS

- 5.1 A question to resolve is whether light vessels are ever part of the IALA Maritime Buoyage System (MBS), and therefore whether the colour of the hull structure (and superstructure) is relevant and whether a topmark would ever be carried.
- 5.2 'Major floating aids' are described in part 8 'Other Marks' of the IALA publication 'IALA-AISM Maritime Buoyage System and other Aids to Navigation' Edition 2 2010, along with other non-MBS marks such as leading lights, sector lights, lighthouses, beacons and auxiliary marks. The shape is described as 'Vessel or buoy shape with light tower' and the colour as 'As appropriate predominantly red'. We have confirmed that all light vessels in UK waters are 'painted IALA standard red' and not part of MBS (and so carry no IALA topmark). However, potentially they could be other colours. It is not known whether any form part of the MBS and carry IALA topmarks.

6. INT1

P6 is used for 'major floating light' but at present includes only the LANBY symbol (for a feature which is probably no longer in existence), the very symbol which is considered not suitable for a light vessel (see CSPCWG9-08.2A). To leave this symbol alone representing major floating lights seems odd, while locating the new symbol alongside minor light floats possibly diminishes any distinction. Section Q deals more with structures than lights; while the reason for choosing a new symbol is to do with

structure, the main emphasis remains the importance of the light exhibited from that structure.

Conclusions.

A more distinctive symbol is required which should not include the confusing cross on the central mast. It could be a plan or profile symbol.

As a major light it should be referenced to INT1 Section P rather than Q.

Recommendations.

Design a new symbol, either:

- A profile symbol to reflect actual shape, with light tower/lantern shape amidships. This could be a based on a larger version of existing Q30;
- A plan symbol comprising a standard light star on a boat shape (as L17).

Agree whether the light should be:

- Highlighted by appropriately coloured flare; or
- All-round circle.

Make no provision for colour or topmark. If a 'light vessel' is used as a MBS mark, the light float symbol (Q30) should be used.

Justification and Impacts.

Some changes to S-4 and INT1, depending on decisions about symbol selected.

Action required of CSPCWG.

The CSPCWG is invited to consider the options above and advise the Secretary on how to progress the action.

Note on the CSPCWG proposal to reinstate a symbol for light vessel

G. Bessero - IHB 23 April 2014

Following CSPCWG-10 (action 16), a draft IHO CL has been prepared to propose the reinstatement of a symbol for light vessel. The draft CL was submitted to the IHB on 15 April 2014.

The action was initiated by paper CSPCWG9-08.2A, submitted by UK, which originates from a request from a "retired navigator in UKHO who is currently a senior editor of UKHO's Admiralty Sailing Directions" referring to "inconsistencies between what is shown on the chart, how we describe a light vessel and what is actually on station". The interlocutor further notes:

"From a mariner's point of view the Q26 symbol is misleading as he would expect to see a Lanby-like buoy, that is a circular hull about 5 m in diameter. The mismatch between the shape of what the mariner sees and the shape of what is shown on the chart introduces an element of doubt in the mariner's mind which we should be helping to avoid."

The current edition of S-4 (Ed. 4.4.0¹) mentions "light vessels" in the following specifications:

B-462.8 Light float. A boat-shaped structure used instead of a light buoy in waters where strong streams or currents are experienced, or when a greater elevation than that of a light buoy is necessary, eg:

(Q30)

Formerly, unmanned light vessels were called 'major light floats'. These are now charted as major floating lights, see B-474.

B-474.1 Major floating lights are generally classed as those with a nominal range in excess of 10 nautical miles. Special circumstances, eg an isolated location, may mean that a floating light of lower range is given this status. The structure on which the light is fixed will be a light vessel, a major light float or a LANBY (Large Automatic Navigational Buoy, which is a type of superbuoy; see B-460.4).

B-474.2 The symbol for a major floating light must be

(P6)

The colour of the structure does not indicate on which side it should be passed and therefore should not be charted (this is consistent with the omission of colour from major shore light structures on paper charts). Details of the structure may be found in List of Lights and Fog Signals (LL).

The paper CSPCWG9-08.2A recalls that "IHO Member States approved (by CL15/1994) the use of the P6/Q26 'LANBY' symbol for all major floating lights in response to CL 44/1993. All 'major floating lights' includes 'light vessels' by definition; see (B-474.1). The old Light Vessel symbol (boat shape with three masts and an X on the central mast) became obsolescent (P6 Column 4). It is understood that this symbology change was originally proposed by IALA. Unfortunately, these CLs are not available on the IHO website and the Secretary has not been able to recover any copies."

The report of CSPCWG9 indicates:

The meeting agreed that there should be a separate symbol for depicting light vessels (or lightships), distinct from the 'LANBY' and minor light float symbols. The old distinction between 'manned light vessels' and 'unmanned major light floats' is no longer relevant; the visual appearance of the vessel, very different from a large buoy, is considered more significant. The symbol should be based on a slightly simplified version of the obsolescent P6 (3 masts with 'X' on centre mast, no 'shading' to stern and bow, flare from position circle). It was considered that most mariners would expect to find the symbol in section Q rather than P, so Q32 was suggested to be the place in INT1, with the sub-title changed to 'Light floats and Light vessels'.

Further considerations were devoted to the symbol itself but there is no indication of further discussion on the merit of reinstating a distinct symbol for light vessel which had been deleted through change 1/1994 to then IHO Publication M-4 (now S-4).

Although the IHO Circular Letters prior to 1999 are not available from the IHO website, they are readily available at the IHB in paper form. The proposal to use the same symbol for all major floating aids, regardless of their shape, was proposed to Member States in IHO CL 44/1993. No objection was received at the IHB and the approval of the change was reported in IHO CL 15/1994.

The justification for adopting a single symbol for all major floating aids was as follows (extract from CL 44/1993): "Modern major floating aids to navigation may be structures such as light-vessels, major light-floats and LANBYS, and they normally carry similar types and standards of light and electronic equipment. A number of Lighthouse Authorities find it desirable to interchange the type of structure on some stations in order to provide the required level of service. If this interchange is carried out on a regular basis, it requires the frequent issue of Notices to Mariners and correction of charts and other documents, as the Chart Specifications of the IHO (M-4) provide different symbols for each type of aid.

In 1989 the International Association of Lighthouse Authorities (IALA) asked the Chart Standardization Committee (CSC) to consider whether a single symbol could be used for all major floating aids to avoid the need for such corrections.

The members of the CSC agreed with the principle of the request, although considerable time was spent in agreeing a symbol for use."

Based on these elements, it is recommended that the issue be reconsidered by the CSPCWG, taking into account the full background to the proposal of 1993 and in liaison with IALA.

Moreover, the CSPCWG should also consider the impact of any change in S-4 on the encoding and portrayal of ENCs, noting that the draft new edition of the Use of the Object Catalogue for ENC (UOC edition 4.0.0 - see IHO CL 18/2014) refers to B-462.8 only for encoding light floats and light vessels (see clause 12.4.2).

Additionally, it is noted that the proposal introduces a new symbol Q26 in place of the current P6. Then it is not clear what symbol should be used to portray an unlit superbuoy (current symbol Q26), if required.