

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
Component	CO ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the CO ³	Proposed change by the CO	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
	2J	18.3, 18.3.1 & 26.10			Remark 18.3.1 contradicts feature model structure in 18.3. As per 18.3 Light Characteristic can only be encoded under complex attribute rhythm of light. There is no option to encode light characteristic under light sector as the text says. 26.10 also contradicts table 18.3 as per light characteristic attribute.	To be discussed by TSMAD27	
	2J	18.2			Feature: 'Light all around', 'light sectored' Attribute: Colour; Multiplicity: 1,*	Suggest the multiplicity be '1,*(ordered)'. It is important for lights with alternating characteristic.	
	2J	18.3			Feature: 'Light sectored' Attribute: Colour; Multiplicity: 1,*	Suggest the multiplicity be '1,*(ordered)'. It is important for lights with alternating characteristic.	
	2J	18.2			Feature: 'Light all around' Attribute: Light visibility; Allowable Encoding Values: 1 – High intensity; 2 – Low intensity. Multiplicity: 0,*	Mistake in 'Multiplicity'. If there can be values 1 and 2 only, obviously they cannot be both, i.e. multiplicity=0,* is incorrect. It should be changed to the value '0,1'.	
	2J				Feature: all features containing colourPattern Attribute: Colour Pattern; Multiplicity: 0,1	In S57 the attribute COLPAT is 'List' type. List type was intended for features with complex pattern. It is widespread the use of stripe patterns with border stripe. Suggest changing multiplicity to 1,*	

1 **CO** = Contributing Organisation (HOs should use 2 character codes e.g. FR AU etc.)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

3 Whilst not compulsory, comments are more likely to be accepted if accompanied by a proposed change.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
Component	CO ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the CO ³	Proposed change by the CO	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
	2J	4.2			Feature: 'Local Magnetic Anomaly' Attributes: 'Magnetic anomaly value maximum' (VALLMA), 'Magnetic anomaly value minimum'; Allowable Encoding Value: <i>anomaly value maximum < anomaly value minimum (+/- decimal degrees)</i>	Suggest removing statement (+/- decimal degrees). VALLMA attribute description gives units as minutes (')	
	2J	4.1			Feature: 'Magnetic Variation' Attribute: 'Value of annual change in magnetic variation' (VALACM), 'Value of magnetic variation'(VALMAG); Allowable Encoding Value: " +/- decimal minutes. Positive (unsigned) value indicates easterly. Negative value indicates westerly"	Not clear what "decimal minutes" ? mean. Is it units of measure or resolution of attributes values. If it is the first it contradicts of Attributes description in the clause 24.161 and 24.163 correspondingly. Suggest removing statement (+/- decimal minutes)	
	2J	8.14			Feature: 'Mooring facility' Attribute: TOPMAR is missing	Mooring facilities with CATMOR;7 Mooring Buoy need the TOMAR attribute. Suggest adding.	

1 **CO** = Contributing Organisation (HOs should use 2 character codes e.g. FR AU etc.)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

3 Whilst not compulsory, comments are more likely to be accepted if accompanied by a proposed change.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
Component	CO ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the CO ³	Proposed change by the CO	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
	2J	24.88 vs. 20.2			Feature: Radio Station Attribute: Estimated range	20.2 describes Estimated range while 24.88 states Estimated range of transmission. Descriptions must be unified.	
	2J	14.7			Feature: 'Offshore production area' Attribute: Restriction;	Attribute RESTRN=27 "speed restricted" seems to be missed. If it is not an error consider reinstating.	
	2J	14.7			Feature: 'Offshore production area' Attribute: Category of offshore production area; Allowable Encoding Value: the value "Tank farm" has been omitted	DCEG describes the area of oil and gas extracting in the point 14.7.1. It explains that there are many places with floating tanks for oil storage. We then need the value "tank farm" or "floating tank farm" in the attribute "Category of offshore production area"	
	2J	14.7			Feature: 'Offshore production area' Attribute: Product; Allowable Encoding Value: the value 23: "electricity" has been omitted	As far as we understand the product of the "1 : offshore wind farm; 2 : wave farm; 3 : current farm" is electricity. It is strange that it has been omitted in the list of allowed values of the attribute 'Product'	
	2J	6.10			Feature: 'Pipeline overhead' (PIPOHD) Attributes: 'Category of pipeline/pipe' 'Product'; Multiplicity: "0,1"	It looks strange that these attributes cannot be listed, i.e. Multiplicity = "0,*". This feature type has the attribute 'Multiplicity of feature'. It means there can be several pipes in one place and they can have different purposes. I suppose there should be the same Multiplicity values as for the attributes in 'Pipeline submarine/on land'	

- 1 **CO** = Contributing Organisation (HOs should use 2 character codes e.g. FR AU etc.)
 - 2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial
 - 3 Whilst not compulsory, comments are more likely to be accepted if accompanied by a proposed change.
- NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
Component	CO ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the CO ³	Proposed change by the CO	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
						(PIPSOL) feature type.	
	2J	8.17			Feature: 'Pontoon' Attributes: 'Function' - removed;	This attribute was added to the object class 'PONTON' according to 7.Co.7 We suppose it is a mistake. We believe that the attribute is important for pontoons.	
	2J	15.5			Feature: Recommended track (RECTRC) Attributes: Orientation Multiplicity: "1,1"	The attribute 'Orientation' for RECTRC should be conditional mandatory. This attribute may be omitted for recommended tracks not based on fixed marks, where it is not straight line. In this case its multiplicity should be written as '0,1'. "This conditionality should be described in clause 15.5.1	
	2J	19.13			Feature: Daymark (DAYMAR) Attributes: 'Pictorial representation' (PICREP) is omitted	Feature type 'Daymark' does not include the attribute 'Pictorial representation'. There are a lot of cases where image of the day mark is encoded especially when 'Daymark' encodes a structure object. In such cases it is used as a beacon but all features type of beacons have the attribute 'Pictorial representation'. Suggest adding this attribute back.	
	2J	5.11			Feature: Vegetation (VEGATN) Attributes: Category of vegetation (CATVEG) Allowable Encoding Value: the value "11: reed" has been removed Multiplicity: "1,1"	Suggest reinstating reed to CATVEG since it has orientation features as well as for backwards compatibility with S-57. Suggest CATVEG Multiplicity to be upgraded to (1.*) since it is common to find vegetation that is mixed and diverse.	

1 **CO** = Contributing Organisation (HOs should use 2 character codes e.g. FR AU etc.)
 2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial
 3 Whilst not compulsory, comments are more likely to be accepted if accompanied by a proposed change.
NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
Component	CO ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the CO ³	Proposed change by the CO	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

1 **CO** = Contributing Organisation (HOs should use 2 character codes e.g. FR AU etc.)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

3 Whilst not compulsory, comments are more likely to be accepted if accompanied by a proposed change.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.